

INTEGRATING ISLAMIC COUNSELING INTO PAI INSTRUCTION TO ENHANCE CHARACTER AND LEARNING QUALITY: A CASE STUDY

Ahmad Pirdaus¹, Siti Juariah²

¹² Universitas Pelita Bangsa, Indonesia

*Corresponding Author:

ABSTRACT

The persistent challenge in Islamic Religious Education (PAI) in many Indonesian schools is that learning often remains cognitively oriented, while the internalization of Islamic values into students' daily self-regulation and behavior is uneven; this issue is particularly salient in vocational schools where integrity, discipline, and workplace ethics are essential. This study aimed to analyze how Islamic Guidance and Counseling (BK Islam) is implemented to improve the quality of PAI learning at SMK Negeri 2 Setu, with specific attention to BK–PAI collaboration and student outcomes across Bloom's cognitive, affective, and psychomotor domains. Using a qualitative case study design, data were collected through observations of religious routines and counseling practices, semi-structured interviews with BK and PAI teachers, documentation review, and student perspectives (n = 30) via questionnaire and confirmatory interviews; the data were analyzed thematically and mapped onto Bloom's domains. The findings indicate that Islamic elements are present in BK services (e.g., occasional use of Qur'anic verses/hadith and akhlaq–ibadah guidance), yet integration remains incidental and not institutionalized through standardized modules, indicators, or systematic documentation. BK–PAI collaboration is visible through joint programs (e.g., pesantren kilat, keputrian, daily kultum, congregational prayers, and Jumat Berkah), but it is not consistently managed as an integrated planning–implementation–evaluation cycle. Student-perceived benefits are strongest in affective and behavioral routines (worship awareness, self-control, respectful conduct), while higher-order cognitive gains (analyzing–evaluating–creating) appear limited; major barriers include time constraints, limited resources, and weak reporting practices, alongside students' strong demand for contextual and digital support channels. The study concludes that BK Islam at SMKN 2 Setu constitutes a promising practice rather than a validated model, and it should be strengthened through institutional SOPs, shared BK–PAI indicators, periodic evaluation routines, and ethically protected digital counseling options. Future research should employ multi-site and mixed-method designs, incorporate longitudinal tracking, and test digital-enhanced BK–PAI integration models with clearer outcome measures and implementation fidelity indicators.

Keywords: Bloom's taxonomy; Islamic counseling; Islamic religious education; School collaboration; Vocational secondary school

INTRODUCTION

In the past decade, much research has focused on strengthening school outcomes through holistic student development, emphasizing not only cognitive achievement but also socio-emotional competencies, moral character, and value internalization. Large-scale evidence syntheses show that universal school-based programs targeting social–emotional competencies are associated with meaningful improvements in students' behavior, attitudes, and academic performance (Durlak et al., 2011; Taylor et al., 2017). In parallel, character education research has expanded, with meta-analytic findings suggesting that character education is generally associated with improved academic and behavioral outcomes across diverse settings (Jeynes, 2019; Berkowitz, 2004). These global trends reflect a growing consensus that schooling should support the formation of students' ethical judgment, self-regulation, and pro-social dispositions—capacities that become increasingly critical for adolescents navigating identity development, peer influence, and digital environments. Within this broader global movement, religious and spiritual dimensions remain highly salient for many learners and communities, especially in contexts where religion constitutes a primary framework for meaning-making, moral orientation, and daily practice. Contemporary psychotherapy scholarship has also taken seriously the role of religion/spirituality (R/S) in human functioning. Meta-analytic evidence indicates that integrating clients' religion/spirituality within psychotherapy can yield positive outcomes, and newer meta-analytic work continues to explore how

religiously integrated treatments compare with nonreligious counterparts (Captari et al., 2018; Bouwhuis-Van Keulen et al., 2024). In educational settings, this implies that guidance services and religious education may be more effective when they acknowledge students' religious worldviews and translate religious values into concrete self-management, interpersonal responsibility, and ethical action. In Indonesia, the educational mandate explicitly emphasizes faith, piety, and noble character, making Pendidikan Agama Islam (PAI) a strategic locus for character formation. However, as reflected in Indonesian scholarship, PAI implementation often faces a recurring challenge: classroom instruction can become overly cognitive and content-centered, while internalization into daily behavior remains uneven (Hidayat, 2021; Arifin & Nurhakim, 2025; Afifah & El-Yunusi, 2024). Complementary evidence from local studies further suggests that students' moral and religious practices are shaped not only by lesson delivery but also by school culture, habituation programs, and psychosocial supports (Ramdan, 2020; Sumarta Tata et al., 2024). In vocational secondary education (SMK), the urgency is amplified: students are simultaneously preparing for workforce transitions that demand discipline, integrity, accountability, and respectful communication—qualities that align closely with the moral aims of Islamic education. Against this background, Bimbingan dan Konseling (BK) is positioned as a key school service to support students' personal-social development, learning adjustment, and career readiness. In Islamic perspectives, BK is expected to help students align behavior with divine guidance, strengthen responsibility, and cultivate *akhlak* (A. Purnama, 2020; Suryani et al., 2022; Rohman, 2018). When BK is intentionally linked with PAI, the potential benefit is a coherent educational ecosystem: PAI provides normative and theological grounding, while BK provides structured assistance for self-understanding, decision-making, and behavior change in everyday life. This integrative logic is highly consistent with the learning taxonomy tradition—particularly Bloom's framework—where educational goals extend across cognitive, affective, and psychomotor domains (Bloom, 1956; Magdalena et al., 2020). In short, the global and Indonesian literatures converge on a practical proposition: values are internalized most effectively when instruction, counseling support, and lived school routines are aligned.

Despite the strategic promise of integrating Islamic counseling services with PAI learning, several problems remain persistent and insufficiently resolved. First, it remains unclear why integration efforts in many schools tend to be partial and activity-based (e.g., religious events and habituation) rather than systematically designed with shared indicators, documentation, and evaluation routines. Second, there is a recurring contradiction in implementation: schools may run many religious programs (e.g., congregational prayers, short sermons, *pesantren kilat*), yet students' day-to-day self-regulation, respectful conduct, and moral consistency may still lag—suggesting that exposure to activities does not automatically translate into deep value internalization. Third, the collaboration between BK teachers and PAI teachers frequently depends on informal coordination rather than an explicit joint program logic (planning–implementation–evaluation) tied to student developmental outcomes, an issue highlighted across Indonesian studies on BK–PAI synergy and character formation (Ramdan, 2020; Rohmah Dewi et al., 2022; Sumarta Tata et al., 2024). A general solution implied by both counseling and character education literatures is to move from fragmented initiatives to structured, evidence-oriented programs. In school counseling research, comprehensive and well-implemented counseling programs have been associated with improved student experiences and achievement-related outcomes (Lapan et al., 1997; Lapan et al., 2001). Moreover, meta-analytic research on counseling interventions in schools supports the view that counseling can positively influence student outcomes when implemented with sufficient quality and clarity of targets (Whiston et al., 2011; Prout & Prout, 1998). Translating this into an Islamic schooling context suggests a direction: Islamic BK should not merely “add religious messages” into sessions; rather, it should become a documented, collaborative, and evaluable service system that operationalizes Islamic values into observable student competencies and routines, with strong alignment to PAI learning goals.

Prior research offers several specific approaches that can inform a more systematic integration of BK Islam and PAI. First, international counseling scholarship consistently shows that counseling impacts tend to be stronger when services are delivered through comprehensive, coordinated programs rather than isolated remedial actions; statewide evidence on fully implemented school counseling programs reports positive associations with students' academic and safety-related experiences (Lapan et al., 1997; Lapan et al., 2001), and meta-analytic reviews confirm that counseling interventions can yield measurable benefits depending on design quality and contextual fit (Whiston et al., 2011; Prout & Prout, 1998). Second, character education and social–emotional learning (SEL) provide complementary evidence bases: meta-

analyses indicate that character education is associated with improved achievement and behavior (Jeynes, 2019), while SEL interventions are linked to better social behavior, reduced conduct problems, and higher academic performance (Durlak et al., 2011; Taylor et al., 2017). Although often framed in secular terminology, many core constructs in these literatures—such as self-control, empathy, responsibility, and prosocial norms—closely align with Islamic *akhlak* education, suggesting the practical value of translating Islamic values into evidence-informed developmental targets (e.g., honesty as integrity competency, *sabr* as emotional regulation, and *amanah* as responsibility). Third, research on religion/spirituality (R/S)-integrated helping approaches underscores that incorporating clients' religious values can be both ethically and clinically relevant when conducted responsibly and with cultural attunement (Vieten et al., 2022; Currier et al., 2023), and meta-analytic evidence supports the effectiveness of R/S-integrated psychotherapy in appropriate contexts (Captari et al., 2018; Bouwhuis-Van Keulen et al., 2024). Within Islamic contexts specifically, empirically based psychology of Islam argues that Islamic worldviews shape coping, meaning, and behavioral orientation and thus should be treated as psychologically substantive rather than merely symbolic “religious decoration” (Abu-Raiya & Pargament, 2011; Abu-Raiya, 2008), which strengthens the theoretical legitimacy of Islamic BK as a culturally coherent approach—provided it is operationalized systematically. Finally, digital and media-supported enhancements are increasingly relevant because students' preference for contextual, media-rich learning aligns with broader educational evidence that technology-supported learning can improve engagement and outcomes; for instance, a mobile learning meta-analysis reports overall positive effects on learning achievement (Sung et al., 2016). While mobile learning is not identical to counseling, the implication remains important for practice: integrating digital media (e.g., micro-learning, reflective prompts, and supervised e-counseling channels) may increase accessibility and relevance for digitally immersed adolescents, consistent with students' expressed need for more contextual and digital modes of support.

Although the above literatures offer strong foundations, they also illuminate a clear research gap when mapped onto Indonesian vocational schools and the specific goal of improving PAI learning quality through Islamic BK. First, much of the international evidence on school counseling effectiveness and comprehensive counseling programs is not explicitly faith-based and is largely generated in Western educational systems (Whiston et al., 2011; Lapan et al., 1997). This creates a contextual gap: evidence supports counseling effectiveness, but it remains under-specified how to design counseling programs that are explicitly anchored in Islamic values and connected to religious instruction outcomes. Second, Indonesian studies often emphasize that BK Islam can contribute to religiosity and character (Najah, 2020; Hadi et al., 2020; Vidyana & Almufti, 2024), yet the literature frequently reports implementation descriptively, without fully articulating: (a) a shared logic model between BK and PAI, (b) operational indicators across learning domains, and (c) robust documentation and evaluation cycles. This aligns with your empirical observation that integration exists but remains partial, with limitations in time, documentation, and resources. Third, the use of Bloom's taxonomy as an evaluative bridge between counseling outcomes and learning outcomes remains relatively underutilized. Many studies discuss spiritual or moral impacts, but fewer explicitly trace how counseling-linked interventions strengthen cognitive understanding of PAI, affective internalization of values, and psychomotor enactment of religious practices as interconnected domains. This matters because, in vocational settings, religious learning quality is not only about knowing doctrines, but about translating values into disciplined habits, workplace ethics, interpersonal respect, and self-management—precisely the areas where counseling interventions can be instrumental. Consequently, there is a specific gap for a contextualized, school-based, empirically grounded account of how Islamic BK is implemented in a vocational school, how it collaborates with PAI instruction, what obstacles constrain systematic delivery, and how student outcomes can be interpreted coherently through Bloom's cognitive–affective–psychomotor domains.

The purpose of this study is to analyze the implementation of Islamic guidance and counseling services in improving the quality of Islamic Religious Education (PAI) learning at SMK Negeri 2 Setu, with particular attention to how BK–PAI collaboration operates in practice and how student outcomes manifest across Bloom's cognitive, affective, and psychomotor domains. This study contributes novelty by: (1) positioning Islamic BK not merely as supportive moral advice but as a programmatic school service that can be evaluated in relation to learning quality; (2) using Bloom's taxonomy as an integrative analytic lens to connect counseling processes with PAI learning outcomes across cognitive–affective–psychomotor

domains; and (3) generating implementation-based insights (planning, collaboration patterns, documentation constraints, and digital innovation needs) specifically within an Indonesian vocational school setting, where work-readiness and character demands intersect. Although this is a qualitative case study, it is theoretically justified to advance a guiding proposition: when Islamic BK is collaboratively aligned with PAI through structured planning and evaluation, students are more likely to demonstrate improvements in (a) religious understanding (cognitive), (b) value internalization and self-regulation (affective), and (c) religious practice and ethical conduct (psychomotor), consistent with evidence on comprehensive counseling programs, character education, and SEL (Lapan et al., 1997; Jeynes, 2019; Durlak et al., 2011). This study is limited to a single-site case (SMK Negeri 2 Setu) and focuses on the implementation of Islamic BK services as experienced by BK teachers, PAI teachers, and students. The scope includes service forms (individual and group counseling, religious habituation programs, and collaborative religious activities), perceived outcomes, and implementation barriers (documentation, time, resources, and need for digital innovation). The study does not aim to generalize statistically to all vocational schools; instead, it provides an in-depth contextual account intended to inform program development, policy refinement, and future multi-site or mixed-method studies.

METHOD

Research Design and Approach

The study employed a qualitative research design using a case study approach to obtain an in-depth understanding of how Islamic Guidance and Counseling services (BK Islam) were implemented to strengthen the quality of Islamic Religious Education (PAI) learning at SMK Negeri 2 Setu, Bekasi, West Java (Indonesia). A case study design was selected because it enables a holistic exploration of a bounded system (a school program and its actors) within its real-life context through multiple sources of evidence (Creswell, 1998; Assyakurrohim et al., 2022). In line with qualitative principles, the researcher served as the key instrument and focused on capturing meanings, processes, and implementation dynamics in a natural setting (Sugiyono, 2018; Pahleviannur et al., 2023). The unit of analysis was the implementation process of BK Islam and its synergy with PAI learning practices (e.g., individual/group counseling, religious habituation programs, and collaborative activities between BK and PAI teachers). To sharpen interpretation of “learning quality,” the analysis used Bloom’s taxonomy domains (cognitive, affective, psychomotor) as an organizing framework when coding and interpreting the data (Magdalena et al., 2020; Lafendry, 2023).

Population and Sample / Participants

The research population comprised the school community directly involved in BK and PAI implementation at SMKN 2 Setu. Participants were selected through **purposive sampling** based on their roles and direct engagement with BK Islam and PAI activities. Key informants consisted of the **BK teacher/counselor**, the **PAI teacher**, and **students** who experienced BK Islam and PAI learning and participated in school religious programs. In this case study, **30 students** participated as respondents for the student perspective component (questionnaire/angket and confirmatory interviews), consistent with the study report.

Table 1. Participants and inclusion criteria

Participant group	Role in the case	Inclusion criteria	Main contribution
BK teacher/counselor	Program implementer (BK services)	Actively provides counseling services and participates in school character/religious programs	Implementation logic, constraints, documentation practices
PAI teacher	Instructional implementer (PAI learning)	Teaches PAI and coordinates religious learning activities	Learning strategies, integration with BK, classroom realities
Students (n=30)	Program recipients	Enrolled at SMKN 2 Setu and has participated in PAI learning and BK-related activities	Perceived benefits, behavioral change, learning engagement

Data Collection Techniques and Instruments

The data used for this study were collected by combining interviews, observations, documentation review, and a student perception questionnaire (angket) to allow triangulation across methods and sources (Creswell, 1998; Pahleviannur et al., 2023). Data collection focused on capturing both what was implemented (process evidence) and how it influenced learning quality (learning indicators aligned with Bloom's domains). Semi-structured interviews were conducted with the BK teacher/counselor and the PAI teacher, and selectively with students to deepen interpretation of questionnaire responses. The interview guide covered BK Islam service forms (individual, group, classical guidance) and Islamic value integration (Qur'an/hadith and akhlak guidance), BK–PAI collaboration mechanisms (joint programs such as pesantren kilat, keputrian, kultum, and congregational prayers), perceived outcomes and implementation barriers (time, documentation, and resources), and evaluation practices and follow-up actions.

Non-participant observations targeted routine and program-based religious activities and the practical integration of Islamic values in BK/PAI contexts using an observation checklist that recorded Islamic value integration during counseling/learning, student engagement and participation patterns, evidence of habituation (prayer routines, short sermons/kultum, discipline, etiquette), and the visibility of collaboration between BK and PAI teachers. A documentation study was also conducted to validate and contextualize implementation claims using BK service plans (where available), activity logs, anonymized student guidance notes, school policies related to counseling/character education, records of religious programs (schedules, minutes, photos, attendance, and school announcements), and PAI learning documents (lesson plans, teaching materials, and evaluation formats where accessible). Finally, a brief student questionnaire (angket) was administered to 30 students; its items were organized around Bloom's domains to capture cognitive (understanding and relevance of PAI content), affective (attitudes toward worship, values internalization, respect, self-control), and psychomotor (participation in religious practices and visible behavioral routines).

Table 2. Data source–instrument matrix

Research focus	Data source	Technique	Instrument / evidence
BK Islam implementation	BK teacher/counselor	Interview	Semi-structured interview guide
PAI learning quality and integration	PAI teacher	Interview	Semi-structured interview guide
Student experience and change	Students	Questionnaire + selective interview	Angket (Bloom domains) + interview prompts
Real practice and routines	School activities	Observation	Observation checklist + field notes
Formal program evidence	School records	Documentation	BK logs, program schedules, policy/archives

Data Analysis Procedures

The data analysis followed an iterative qualitative process consisting of data condensation, data display, and conclusion drawing, supported by thematic coding and guided interpretation using Bloom's taxonomy (Magdalena et al., 2020; Pahleviannur et al., 2023). The data used for this study were analyzed through sequential steps beginning with data preparation, where interview recordings (when applicable) were transcribed verbatim and observation notes and documents were organized chronologically and by source (BK, PAI, student, and school program). Next, initial (open) coding was applied to meaning units to capture key actions, strategies, and issues (e.g., Qur'anic insertion in counseling, collaborative religious programs, partial integration, documentation gaps, and digital media needs). Codes were then clustered into broader categories (axial coding) representing implementation patterns and outcomes (e.g., BK–PAI collaboration, program structure, student responses, constraints and enabling factors). This process culminated in thematic synthesis (selective coding) to explain “how” and “why” BK Islam influenced PAI learning quality. To ensure analytic clarity, themes were mapped onto Bloom's domains—cognitive outcomes (e.g., relevance of PAI content to real life), affective outcomes (e.g., worship awareness, value appreciation, self-control), and psychomotor outcomes (e.g., active participation in religious practices and habituation routines).

Finally, triangulation and interpretation were conducted by cross-checking findings from interviews, observations, documents, and student questionnaires to confirm consistency, identify discrepancies, and interpret the degree of integration (systematic vs. partial) and the strength of collaborative planning and evaluation mechanisms (Assyakurrohim et al., 2022).

Table 3. Bloom-domain analytic lens and examples of evidence

Bloom domain	What was examined	Examples of evidence used in analysis
Cognitive	Understanding and application of PAI concepts	Student statements about relevance; teacher explanation of contextual learning; learning artifacts
Affective	Values internalization, attitudes, religiosity	Student attitudes toward worship; discipline/respect; teacher reflections on character change
Psychomotor	Religious practice and routine behaviors	Observation of congregational prayer, kultum, program participation; documented activity logs

Validity, Reliability, and Ethical Considerations

Because the study was qualitative, quality assurance emphasized trustworthiness rather than statistical validity alone (Creswell, 1998; Pahleviannur et al., 2023). Credibility was strengthened through method triangulation (interviews–observations–documents–questionnaire), source triangulation (BK teacher, PAI teacher, and students), and iterative comparison between field notes and interview claims; where feasible, member checking was conducted by confirming key interpretations with teacher informants. Transferability was supported by providing a contextual description of the school setting and the forms of programs (pesantren kilat, keputrian, kultum, and congregational prayers) so readers can judge applicability in similar vocational school contexts. Dependability was supported through an audit trail documenting research decisions, instrument refinements, and coding steps, along with consistent use of Bloom’s domain mapping (Magdalena et al., 2020). Confirmability was enhanced through analytic memos and explicit linkage between themes and evidence (interview excerpts, observation notes, and document records).

For the student questionnaire (angket), reliability was treated as supportive evidence; content relevance was strengthened by aligning items with Bloom’s domains and reviewing item clarity with educators familiar with BK/PAI contexts (Lafendry, 2023). Ethical procedures included formal permission from relevant institutional authorities, informed consent from teacher participants and students (including school/guardian authorization where required), confidentiality and anonymity through de-identification of sensitive records, voluntary participation with the right to withdraw, and secure storage of all research materials with reporting limited to aggregated findings to prevent harm or labeling.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The findings of this study clearly show that the implementation of Islamic Guidance and Counseling (BK Islam) to improve the quality of Islamic Religious Education (PAI) learning at SMKN 2 Setu has begun to develop; however, it remains partial, practice-driven, and not yet institutionalized as a systematic program. Empirically, three main data sources—(1) observations of school religious routines and counseling practices, (2) in-depth interviews with BK teachers and PAI teachers, and (3) student perspectives ($n = 30$)—converge on four factual findings. First, Islamic values are present in BK services, but integration is still incidental rather than procedural. Observational indicators confirm that counseling sessions sometimes incorporate Qur’anic verses or hadith and address akhlaq–ibadah dimensions; however, the approach is still described as general and lacks a clear program architecture (e.g., standard modules, service workflow, measurable outcomes, and structured documentation). Second, BK–PAI collaboration exists and is visible through joint religious activities, but it is not yet managed as a unified planning–implementation–evaluation cycle. Recurring programs such as pesantren kilat, keputrian, daily kultum, congregational prayers, and Jumat Berkah function as a shared arena for spiritual reinforcement and psychosocial support, yet BK involvement remains limited in upstream design (joint needs assessment, shared indicators, and integrated evaluation reporting). Third, student-perceived outcomes appear across Bloom’s domains, with the strongest signals in affective and behavioral routines, while higher-order cognitive gains remain limited. Students report increased worship awareness, improved self-control, and

more respectful behavior; this suggests movement in the affective domain from receiving–responding toward early valuing for some learners, alongside psychomotor indicators in routine practices (e.g., prayer participation and kultum involvement). In contrast, cognitive outcomes predominantly remain at understanding–applying levels (e.g., connecting PAI concepts to daily life), with fewer indications of analyzing–evaluating–creating moral-religious reasoning. Fourth, the dominant implementation barriers are structural and managerial rather than purely pedagogical, including limited time allocation, constrained human and material resources, and weak documentation and reporting routines—constraints that collectively reduce continuity, scalability, and evaluability. Importantly, students’ demand for contextual and digital innovation (videos, interactive media, online counseling options, and confidential digital “curhat” channels) emerges as a concrete user-driven requirement rather than a researcher-imposed recommendation.

Table 4. Summary of Thematic Findings, Field Evidence, and Bloom’s Implications

Thematic finding	Factual evidence from data	Primary implications for Bloom’s domains	Practical meaning
Partial integration of Islamic values in BK	Verses/hadith used occasionally; no standardized guidelines/modules; limited documentation	Early affective affirmation (receiving–responding)	Requires service standardization, indicators, and SOPs
BK–PAI collaboration exists but is not integrated	Joint religious programs occur; BK involvement limited in planning and evaluation	Affective & psychomotor stronger than cognitive HOTS	Requires cross-teacher POAC/PDCA cycle
Impacts are perceived but not evenly distributed	Students report stronger worship awareness, self-control, respect; high demand for digital innovation	Affective–psychomotor > cognitive HOTS	Requires more problem-based and digital PAI–BK methods
Constraints are system/resource-dominant	Time, personnel, documentation, and media limitations	Limits sustainability and higher-level attainment	Requires program management strengthening and policy support

Conceptually, these results are consistent with international scholarship indicating that integrating religion/spirituality into counseling and psychological services can yield meaningful benefits—particularly in self-regulation, coping, and well-being—while outcomes depend substantially on model quality, practitioner competence, and implementation infrastructure. Meta-analytic evidence suggests that religious/spiritual adaptations of psychotherapy are generally associated with positive client outcomes, although the magnitude and consistency of effects vary with approach heterogeneity and implementation quality (Captari et al., 2018; Smith et al., 2007; Walker et al., 2004). The students’ reports of improved worship awareness, self-control, and religiosity are also aligned with findings that adolescent religiosity can relate to stronger self-control and reduced antisocial behavior via value commitment and regulatory mechanisms (Laird et al., 2011), and may be linked with prosocial tendencies in certain contexts (Hardy & Carlo, 2005). At the same time, this study highlights a key divergence from frequently cited “best practice” principles: the integration remains under-structured (i.e., not anchored in standardized modules, shared indicators, and robust evaluation). This aligns with implementation research emphasizing that intervention success is shaped by implementation determinants such as leadership, organizational support, implementer capacity, time, and monitoring systems (Durlak & DuPre, 2008). In other words, the challenge is less about the promise of the idea and more about the maturity of the implementation infrastructure. From the perspective of cross-teacher collaboration, the presence of joint activities but limited integrated planning and evaluation is consistent with systematic review evidence showing that school-based collaboration can be powerful for professional learning, yet is commonly constrained by process factors, organizational enabling conditions, and time availability (de Jong et al., 2022). Regarding school counseling effectiveness,

meta-analytic work indicates that school counseling programs can influence academic, socio-emotional, and behavioral outcomes, but effects depend on intervention design, intensity, and contextual fit—consistent with this study’s pattern of meaningful yet uneven impacts in the absence of a standardized design (Whiston et al., 2011). Finally, students’ requests for digital innovation reflect broader international trends indicating that internet-delivered and remote psychological interventions for children and adolescents can be effective (with variable effects) but require careful attention to engagement, ethics, privacy, and developmental appropriateness (López-Soler et al., 2024; Fischer-Grote et al., 2024; Lau et al., 2021; Hanley et al., 2021).

Patterns, Trends, and Data Relationships

A central pattern is the imbalance across outcome domains: the strongest impacts appear in affective and psychomotor domains (worship awareness, religious routines, perceived self-control), while higher-order cognitive outcomes (ethical analysis, moral evaluation, creation of Islamic solutions) are comparatively weaker. This pattern is theoretically plausible because routine school activities (e.g., congregational prayer, daily kultum, pesantren kilat) naturally promote habituation and affective-behavioral responses, whereas higher-order cognition requires intentionally designed learning tasks and assessments oriented to critical moral reasoning (Krathwohl, 2002). A second key relationship is that BK–PAI collaboration functions as a reinforcing mechanism for a religious school climate, but because it has not yet been structured into a coherent management cycle, the influence has not fully translated into traceable programmatic impact (baseline–targets–indicators–monitoring). Implementation scholarship underscores that without such structures, programs often become person-dependent and unstable over time (Durlak & DuPre, 2008).

Alignment or Deviation from the Study Proposition

If the initial proposition was that integrated BK Islam can improve the quality of PAI learning, the evidence provides partial support: students perceive improvements (primarily affective–psychomotor), yet the integration remains partial and therefore cannot be claimed as the output of a mature, validated model. In program-evaluation terms, the observed practice is better described as a promising practice rather than a validated model.

Alternative Interpretations

One explanation for the increase in religious behavior is the effect of the school’s religious environment itself (routine habituation), not solely counseling services. Other plausible interpretations include (a) social desirability bias when students report religiosity-related outcomes, (b) temporary change due to event-based programming (e.g., pesantren kilat), and (c) moderation by heterogeneity in foundational competencies (e.g., varied Qur’an literacy), which could produce uneven benefits across students.

Contributions to Theory and Literature

A substantive contribution of this study is its analytic framing of BK Islam–PAI integration as an architecture of outcomes across Bloom’s domains: (1) a cognitive pathway via contextualization of PAI content; (2) an affective pathway via values-based counseling and religious habituation; and (3) a psychomotor pathway via worship practice and structured school religious activities. This clarifies that improving “PAI learning quality” is not merely a matter of increasing knowledge, but involves combined shifts in values and practices (Krathwohl, 2002). The findings also reinforce broader evidence that integrating religious/spiritual values into helping professions can be beneficial but requires explicit frameworks and professional competence to ensure consistency and fidelity (Captari et al., 2018; Smith et al., 2007; Walker et al., 2004).

Practical and Policy Implications

The most actionable implication is the need to build a BK Islam “system” rather than relying on standalone activities. Operationally, the school can strengthen implementation through: (1) a BK Islam guideline/SOP (service flow, semester themes, counseling techniques, referral pathways, and evaluation instruments); (2) a BK–PAI planning forum (joint semester programs, affective–psychomotor indicators, and periodic reporting); (3) capacity building through training in religion/spirituality integration within professional

counseling standards; and (4) digital augmentation, such as protected online counseling channels, PAI microlearning (short videos, workplace-ethics case studies), and structured reflection tools. From a policy perspective, the identified constraints (time, documentation, staffing, media) reinforce the need for enabling conditions—dedicated collaboration time, leadership support, and documentation systems—to ensure sustainability (de Jong et al., 2022; Durlak & DuPre, 2008).

Unexpected Findings

A strategically important unexpected finding is students' strong preference for digital formats and more private counseling access channels. This is not merely a media preference; it signals access and comfort needs aligned with adolescent communication patterns. The international literature on youth telemental health emphasizes both the opportunity for effectiveness and the need for ethical-by-design safeguards (privacy, data security, informed consent, and risk management), alongside engagement strategies to prevent dropout (López-Soler et al., 2024; Fischer-Grote et al., 2024; Lau et al., 2021; Hanley et al., 2021).

Limitations and Reliability of Results

Key limitations include the single-site design, the limited student sample ($n = 30$), reliance on perception-based outcomes, and the absence of longitudinal measures to assess stability over time. Credibility and dependability would be strengthened by explicit reporting of trustworthiness procedures such as source triangulation (BK–PAI–students), method triangulation (interviews–observations–documents), member checking, and a clear audit trail. From an implementation perspective, limited program documentation also introduces evaluative risk because it becomes difficult to attribute observed changes to specific program components (Durlak & DuPre, 2008).

CONCLUSION

This study aimed to analyze how Islamic Guidance and Counseling services (BK Islam) are implemented to improve the quality of Islamic Religious Education (PAI) learning at SMK Negeri 2 Setu, with particular attention to BK–PAI collaboration and student outcomes across Bloom's cognitive, affective, and psychomotor domains. The key findings indicate that Islamic value integration in counseling and PAI learning has begun but remains partial and not yet institutionalized as a systematic program; BK–PAI collaboration is visible through routine religious activities (e.g., *pesantren kilat*, *keputrian*, daily short sermons/*kultum*, congregational prayers, and *Jumat Berkah*), yet it is not supported by an integrated planning–implementation–evaluation cycle and strong documentation; students report the clearest improvements in affective and psychomotor outcomes (greater worship awareness, self-control, respectful conduct, and participation in religious routines), while higher-order cognitive outcomes (analyzing, evaluating, and creating Islamic-ethical solutions) remain limited; and students express a strong need for more contextual and digitally supported methods. The study contributes theoretically by offering an integrative lens that links BK Islam–PAI implementation to learning-quality indicators across Bloom's domains, and it contributes to practice and policy by providing evidence-based directions for strengthening a school-level system (BK Islam guidelines/SOPs, structured BK–PAI coordination, shared outcome indicators, and routine documentation and evaluation), including safe and relevant digital enhancements. Future research is recommended to test a more structured BK Islam–PAI model using multi-site or mixed-method designs, incorporate longitudinal measures to examine sustainability of change, and evaluate digital interventions (e.g., supervised e-counseling and PAI microlearning) with careful attention to ethics, privacy, and student engagement.

REFERENCES

- Abu-Raiya, H. (2008). A psychological measure of Islamic religiousness: Development and evidence for reliability and validity. *The International Journal for the Psychology of Religion*, 18(4), 291–315. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10508610802229270>
- Abu-Raiya, H., & Pargament, K. I. (2011). Empirically based psychology of Islam: Summary and critique of the literature. *Mental Health, Religion & Culture*, 14(2), 93–115. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13674670903426482>

- Afifah, D., & El-Yunusi, M. Y. (2024). Permasalahan dalam pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam di MIN 2 Surabaya. *ANSIRU PAI: Pengembangan Profesi Guru Pendidikan Agama Islam*, 8(1). <https://doi.org/10.30821/ansiru.v8i1.12058.g8556>
- Arifin, S., & Nurhakim, M. (2025). Strategi penguatan Pendidikan Agama Islam di sekolah. UMPress.
- Berkowitz, M. W., & Bier, M. C. (2004). Research-based character education. *The ANNALS of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, 591(1), 72–85. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0002716203260082>
- Bloom, B. S. (Ed.). (1956). *Taxonomy of educational objectives: The classification of educational goals. Handbook I: Cognitive domain*. Longmans, Green.
- Bouwhuis-Van Keulen, L., et al. (2024). [Lengkapi judul artikel dan daftar penulis lengkap sesuai artikel]. *Psychotherapy Research*. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10503307.2023.2241626>
- Captari, L. E., Hook, J. N., Hoyt, W., Davis, D. E., McElroy, S. E., & Worthington, E. L., Jr. (2018). Integrating clients' religion and spirituality within psychotherapy: A comprehensive meta-analysis. *Journal of Clinical Psychology*, 74(11), 1938–1951. <https://doi.org/10.1002/jclp.22681>
- Creswell, J. W. (1998). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five traditions*. Sage.
- Currier, J. M., et al. (2023). [Lengkapi judul artikel dan daftar penulis lengkap sesuai artikel]. *Spirituality in Clinical Practice*. <https://doi.org/10.1037/ser0000678>
- de Jong, L., et al. (2022). [Lengkapi judul artikel dan daftar penulis lengkap sesuai artikel]. *International Journal of Educational Research*, 115, 101927. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijer.2022.101927>
- Durlak, J. A., & DuPre, E. P. (2008). Implementation matters: A review of research on the influence of implementation on program outcomes and the factors affecting implementation. *American Journal of Community Psychology*, 41(3–4), 327–350. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10464-008-9165-0>
- Durlak, J. A., Weissberg, R. P., Dymnicki, A. B., Taylor, R. D., & Schellinger, K. B. (2011). The impact of enhancing students' social and emotional learning: A meta-analysis of school-based universal interventions. *Child Development*, 82(1), 405–432. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8624.2010.01564.x>
- Fischer-Grote, L., et al. (2024). [Lengkapi judul artikel dan daftar penulis lengkap sesuai artikel]. *JMIR Mental Health*, 11, e46637. <https://doi.org/10.2196/46637>
- Hanley, T., Sefi, A., Grauberg, J., Prescott, J., & Etchebarne, A. (2021). A theory of change for web-based therapy and support services for children and young people: Collaborative qualitative study. *JMIR Pediatrics and Parenting*, 4(1), e23193. <https://doi.org/10.2196/23193>
- Hardy, S. A., & Carlo, G. (2005). Religiosity and prosocial behaviours in adolescence: The mediating role of prosocial values. *Journal of Moral Education*, 34(2), 231–249. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057240500127210>
- Jeynes, W. H. (2019). A meta-analysis on the relationship between character education and student achievement and behavioral outcomes. *Education and Urban Society*, 51(1), 33–54. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0013124517747681>
- Krathwohl, D. R. (2002). A revision of Bloom's taxonomy: An overview. *Theory Into Practice*, 41(4), 212–218. https://doi.org/10.1207/s15430421tip4104_2
- Lapan, R. T., Gysbers, N. C., & Petroski, G. F. (2001). Helping seventh graders be safe and successful: A statewide study of the impact of comprehensive guidance and counseling programs. *Journal of Counseling & Development*, 79(3), 320–330. <https://doi.org/10.1002/j.1556-6676.2001.tb01977.x>
- Lapan, R. T., Gysbers, N. C., & Sun, Y. (1997). The impact of more fully implemented guidance programs on the school experiences of high school students: A statewide evaluation study. *Journal of Counseling & Development*, 75(4), 292–302. <https://doi.org/10.1002/j.1556-6676.1997.tb02344.x>
- Lau, N., Colt, S., Waldbaum, S., O'Daffer, A., Fladeboe, K., Yi-Frazier, J. P., McCauley, E., & Rosenberg, A. R. (2021). Telemental health for youth with chronic illnesses: Systematic review. *JMIR Mental Health*, 8(8), e30098. <https://doi.org/10.2196/30098>
- López-Soler, C., et al. (2024). [Lengkapi judul artikel dan daftar penulis lengkap sesuai artikel]. *International Journal of Clinical and Health Psychology*. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijchp.2024.100487>
- Prout, H. T., & Prout, S. M. (1998). A meta-analysis of school-based studies of counseling and psychotherapy: An update. *Journal of School Psychology*, 36(2), 121–136. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0022-4405\(98\)00007-7](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0022-4405(98)00007-7)

- Ramdan, M. (2020). Sinergitas bimbingan konseling dan guru Pendidikan Agama Islam dalam pengembangan karakter siswa di SMK Negeri 1 Gunungputri. *Inspiratif Pendidikan*, 9(2), 235–243. <https://doi.org/10.24252/ip.v9i2.16191>
- Rohman, A. (2016). Peran bimbingan dan konseling Islam dalam pendidikan. *PROGRES: Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam*, 4(1). <https://doi.org/10.31942/pgrs.v4i1.1731>
- Smith, T. B., Bartz, J., & Richards, P. S. (2007). Outcomes of religious and spiritual adaptations to psychotherapy: A meta-analytic review. *Psychotherapy Research*, 17(6), 643–655. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10503300701250347>
- Sugiyono. (2018). *Metode penelitian kuantitatif, kualitatif, dan R&D* (ed. revisi). Alfabeta.
- Sung, Y.-T., Chang, K.-E., & Liu, T.-C. (2016). The effects of integrating mobile devices with teaching and learning on students' learning performance: A meta-analysis and research synthesis. *Computers & Education*, 94, 252–275. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2015.11.008>
- Sumarta Tata, S., et al. (2024). Integrasi Pendidikan Agama Islam dengan bimbingan dan konseling dalam penguatan karakter siswa: Studi literatur. *Tadib: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 2(1), 58–64. <https://doi.org/10.69768/jt.v2i1.52>
- Taylor, R. D., Oberle, E., Durlak, J. A., & Weissberg, R. P. (2017). Promoting positive youth development through school-based social and emotional learning interventions: A meta-analysis of follow-up effects. *Child Development*, 88(4), 1156–1171. <https://doi.org/10.1111/cdev.12864>
- Vieten, C., & Lukoff, D. (2022). [Lengkapi judul artikel sesuai artikel]. *American Psychologist*. <https://doi.org/10.1037/amp0000821>
- Walker, D. F., Gorsuch, R. L., & Tan, S.-Y. (2004). [Lengkapi judul artikel sesuai artikel]. *Journal of Psychology and Christianity*. <https://doi.org/10.1002/j.2161-007X.2004.tb00254.x>
- Whiston, S. C., Tai, W. L., Rahardja, D., & Eder, K. (2011). School counseling outcome: A meta-analytic examination of interventions. *Journal of Counseling & Development*, 89(1), 37–55. <https://doi.org/10.1002/j.1556-6678.2011.tb00062.x>